

ELE of the NSP China Waste Management - Management Response

Draft Version 31 May 2021

1 Background

In 2020, the NSP China Waste Management was subject to an independent mid-project Evaluation and Learning Exercise (ELE) conducted by an evaluation team led by AMBERO Consulting. The ELE report is published on the NAMA Facility's website.

The NSP and TSU to provided responses to the recommendations made by the evaluation team in their ELE report.

2 Response to Recommendations

Recommendations		Management Response	
Recommendation 1	Activities	Responsible Entity	Timeline
Put maximum effort into re-thinking and restoring TA assistance team to develop full IWM strategies, including governance, finance and institutional aspects and 20-year projections of quantity, composition, and GHG impacts. *	The Sino-International Technical Consortium added another domestic expert to the team in February 2021, as the international experts are still unable to visit China. The Chinese experts will conduct the site visits for data collection in May-June and share their findings with the international members to further strengthen their work in China.	NSP	May - June 2021
	The NSP is also considering shifting more efforts of the Consortium from the technical support to the governance and institutional aspects of the IWM system, this will be further discussed with the International Technical Team.		July 2021
	Moreover, the NSP is contracting a cost analysis center to conduct a full cost assignment of the MSW management in the demonstration cities and improve the financial aspect of the IWM systems.		June 2021
Recommendation 2	Activities	Responsible Entity	Timeline
Put more focus on developing publications for Chinese cities	In April 2021, the localisation and publication of the Chinese version of		April 2021

* Note: the NSP considers that this recommendation is difficult to be fulfilled and covered under the current NSP framework without a project extension.

<p>(outside of the PCs) on the broad interpretation of IWM, including references to existing articles and books in the international solid waste literature on planning, scientific research on emissions and solid waste system performance and governance.</p>	<p>the UN-Habitat’s “Waste Wise City Tool (WaCT)” has been completed by the NSP team. The tool contains a step by step guide to assess a city’s municipal solid waste management performance through Sustainable Development Goals. The Chinese version is distributed through the NSP’s dissemination channels.</p> <p>The NSP is considering the possibility on the translation and localisation of the UNEP Global Waste Management Outlook (2020).</p> <p>In cooperation with the Hanns-Seidel-Stiftung (HSS), the NSP prepared the content of the student’s textbook about the 17 SDGs of the United Nations and their link to waste management topics, while HSS was responsible for the content of the respective teacher’s edition, both of which will be published in August 2021.</p>	<p>NSP</p>	<p>August 2021</p> <p>August 2021</p>
<p>Recommendation 3</p>	<p>Activities</p>	<p>Responsible Entity</p>	<p>Timeline</p>
<p>Commission or agree to co-finance translation to Chinese of key articles and books on IWM in European languages. This provides a deeper level of information to anchor the NSP experience.</p>	<p>As mentioned above, the NSP supported UN-Habitat with the translation of the Chinese WaCT version. Additionally, an online seminar was conducted on May 20, 2021, where representatives of Chinese cities got comprehensive instructions on implementation of the tool.</p> <p>Also, the translation of the UNEP Global Waste Management Outlook (2020) is planned.</p>	<p>NSP</p>	<p>May 2021</p> <p>August 2021</p>
<p>Recommendation 4</p>	<p>Activities</p>	<p>Responsible Entity</p>	<p>Timeline</p>
<p>Stimulate virtual city twinning and horizontal information exchange between Chinese cities and European cities, at least as long as COVID travel restrictions are in place. CAUES is the Chinese national member of the International Solid Waste</p>	<p>This recommendation will be adopted by firstly fostering the knowledge and data exchange between the five demonstration cities; secondly inviting representatives of the demonstration cities to several (online) seminars to</p>	<p>NSP</p>	<p>Since April 2021</p>

* Note: the NSP considers that this recommendation is difficult to be fulfilled and covered under the current NSP framework without a project extension.

<p>Association, which has a project on circular and low carbon cities, that could be interesting for Chinese Zero Waste cities and also for the PCs.*</p>	<p>share their city’s waste management experience with other Chinese cities.</p> <p>Furthermore, in May 2021, an online seminar was organised with the support of UN-Habitat to connect and share experiences of the demonstration cities with UN “Waste Wise Cities”.</p> <p>Twinning with European cities will be considered in the future implementation period. Finally, contact and linkages with ISWA circular and low carbon cities will be further discussed.</p>		
Recommendation 5	Activities	Responsible Entity	Timeline
<p>Share the results of MRV monitoring of GHG emissions in the solid waste sector in the PCs more broadly with other Chinese cities, building on the positive experiences with horizontal information exchange in the NSP.</p>	<p>The NSP is continuously presenting the MRV results of the demonstration cities to waste sector stakeholders and other Chinese cities during several events and distribution channels. Recently, the NSP presented the MRV methodology and results during the International Environmental (IE) Expo in Shanghai and will present at the coming CAUES Incineration Symposium in Hangzhou in June 2021.</p>	<p>NSP</p>	<p>Since April 2021</p>
Recommendation 6	Activities	Responsible Entity	Timeline
<p>Put more emphasis on the links between waste management and climate change and bring the discussion and dissemination forward in conferences, training, and publications, because the cities have needs and motivation about climate action and are looking for information.</p>	<p>Against the background of China’s 2030 carbon peak and 2060 carbon neutrality target, the NSP organised several activities to link waste management with climate change mitigation. In April, the NSP training “Low-carbon waste management of the MSW treatment industry under the carbon peak target and carbon neutrality vision” was successfully held with over 30 participants. The Ministry of Human Resources and Social Security (MOHRSS) of the People’s Republic of China issued an official certification to those who passed the final training exam.</p>	<p>NSP</p>	<p>Since April 2021</p>

* Note: the NSP considers that this recommendation is difficult to be fulfilled and covered under the current NSP framework without a project extension.

	<p>The NSP is working on a report and analysis of China's 13th and 14th Five-Year-Plan under the background of waste management and climate change mitigation to further outline the low-carbon development in the sector.</p> <p>In July 2021, the NSP will conduct the Train-the-Trainer program to educate waste management experts and operators, thus disseminating acquired knowledge to other Chinese cities.</p>		<p>July 2021</p> <p>July 2021</p>
Recommendation 7	Activities	Responsible Entity	Timeline
<p>Strengthen lines of communication between the NSP and MOHURD and MEE, so that the CCER scheme and the NSP are coherent with each other.*</p>	<p>The NSP results are exchanged with MoHURD at the yearly steering committee meeting and will be strengthened further with the support from CAUES, which has regular exchange meetings with MoHURD.</p> <p>The NSP conducted an informal exchange with MEE on the MRV methodology and IWM NAMA project results. The potential reopening of the CCER system in March 2021 was also discussed.</p> <p>The potential link with the Zero Waste Cities was also brought up in the meeting, and the MRV and NSP results were appreciated. However, the zero-waste city has a larger boundary, including not only MSW but also many kinds of industrial waste and agriculture waste, etc, so a more systematic methodology is still needed for the zero waste topic.</p>	NSP	April 2021
Recommendation 8	Activities	Responsible Entity	Timeline
<p>Develop training and support materials for cities and potential new private and financial sector partners (also internationals investing in China) that could make use of a variety of climate and green finance funds, not only</p>	<p>The NSP is in close contact with the Asian Infrastructure Investment Bank (AIIB) and KfW Development Bank to share project results and experiences with them and identify climate and green financing options jointly.</p>	NSP	Since March 2021

* Note: the NSP considers that this recommendation is difficult to be fulfilled and covered under the current NSP framework without a project extension.

<p>CCER. For example, some climate finance may be possible from other MEE initiatives, with a focus on reducing methane by improving landfills and implementation of AD and GHG sinks.</p>			
<p>Recommendation 9</p>	<p>Activities</p>	<p>Responsible Entity</p>	<p>Timeline</p>
<p>Fast-track the activity of preparing IWM strategies in the 5 PCs and at the same time include additional cities in an activity to prepare IWM strategies. One approach would be to shift this activity from the international TA team to CAUES and support it from the International Solid Waste Association, of which CAUES is the Chinese national member.</p>	<p>The NSP is preparing support on IWM strategies for the demonstration cities as well as disseminating material to additional Chinese cities by establishing online training courses from Adelphi, which has shifted from the onsite training due to the limit of COVID-19. The online courses will be further transferred to CAUES to enhance the dissemination of the IWM concepts and strategies.</p>	<p>NSP</p>	<p>Since January 2021</p>
<p>Recommendation 10</p>	<p>Activities</p>	<p>Responsible Entity</p>	<p>Timeline</p>
<p>Explore the use of compost to sequester CO2 in soils and work with MEE to include this in the CCER system. *</p>	<p>The NSP finalised the comprehensive Organic Waste Treatment Technology Evaluation, which includes an indicator system for GHG emission mitigation. Based on the final report, the NSP will develop technical standards and policy recommendations for China's organic waste treatment industry.</p>	<p>NSP</p>	<p>Since May 2021</p>
<p>Recommendation 11</p>	<p>Activities</p>	<p>Responsible Entity</p>	<p>Timeline</p>
<p>In the coming private and financial sector IWM activities, intensify those to organise business demo tours to pilot cities, and develop data for investment and operations – the tool has proven to be useful to policymaker and private sector.</p>	<p>The business model is under preparation, and is expected to be published by the end of 2021, and disseminated to the cities thereafter.</p>	<p>NSP</p>	<p>December 2021</p>
<p>Recommendation 12</p>	<p>Activities</p>	<p>Responsible Entity</p>	<p>Timeline</p>
<p>Stimulate research and publications about the improvements in and climate benefits of diverting kitchen waste and organics away from</p>	<p>The NSP finalised the Organic Waste Treatment Technology Evaluation report, which includes the methodology of a full life cycle analysis to evaluate the climate</p>	<p>NSP</p>	<p>Since March 2021</p>

* Note: the NSP considers that this recommendation is difficult to be fulfilled and covered under the current NSP framework without a project extension.

incinerators to AD and composting.	action benefits by treating the organic fraction of MSW.		
Recommendation 13	Activities	Responsible Entity	Timeline
Stimulate research in China and the translation of international research results on the benefits of sequestration of CO ₂ in soils enriched with compost and fertilizer from AD sludges.	The translation of German Biomass Act and the Compost quality control system have been finished and published. Other publications benefitting to knowledge around this topic will be further localised.	NSP	Since 2019
Recommendation 14	Activities	Responsible Entity	Timeline
Move on the intention to pilot Pay as You Throw (PAYT) in the PCs, as the "edge of the wedge" of discussing IWM sustainable financing in cities.	The demonstration cities showed great interest in the sustainable financing of the IWM system since 2020 and during the Steering Committee Meeting in April 2021. The NSP will finish the cost analysis of the MSW management sector, and further guide and support the cities to the possibility of implementation of different waste charging mechanisms.	NSP	Since April 2021
Recommendation 15	Activities	Responsible Entity	Timeline
Develop more activities monitoring the specific impacts of diversification, including scientific articles about its impacts. For example, the IWM approach raises questions on the place of incineration in an IWM system, and research on its impacts on efficiency and energy generation of existing incinerators could be useful.	The NSP contracted several research institutions and universities to conduct reports about the Chinese waste sector. The Technical University of Denmark and Beijing Normal University analysed the GHG emission reduction of waste management activities in the two demonstration cities Bengbu and Suzhou, using the methodology of the full life cycle analysis. Tsinghua University analysed and evaluated the organic waste treatment technologies in the Chinese market. Both research results will be published through the scientific channels of the universities. Finally, greater efforts will be put towards the mitigation effect and integrated waste management.	NSP	Since November 2019
Recommendation 16	Activities	Responsible Entity	Timeline
Research and establish a GHG emissions reduction model for	This is the hot topic currently for the MSW management sector, especially	NSP	Since April 2021

* Note: the NSP considers that this recommendation is difficult to be fulfilled and covered under the current NSP framework without a project extension.

<p>the recycling sector and private enterprises to be included in CCER.*</p>	<p>given the background of carbon peak and carbon neutral strategy. For the MRV of the recycling sector, the barrier is the obscure baseline to which the GHG reduction is not easy to compare due to lack of data management in the recycling sector. This has been targeted by the NSP in the first step. The introduction of WaCT and Wasteaware KPI systems are all going towards solving this problem. More discussions will be organised with different stakeholders to agree on the next agenda. This is an important step towards formalising the still informal recycling sector.</p>		
<p>Recommendation 17</p>	<p>Activities</p>	<p>Responsible Entity</p>	<p>Timeline</p>
<p>Research the efficiency, effectiveness and impact of the private recycling sector in the PCs (and in general), and model potential gains from formalising and integrating the informal recycling activities and monitoring them with MRV.*</p>	<p>The NSP is cooperating with the local governments of the pilot cities to improve the database for the informal recycling sector. In addition, the NSP plans to support the utilisation of WaCT to further quantify the contributions of the informal sector to the recycling rate.</p>	<p>NSP</p>	<p>2022</p>
<p>Recommendation 18</p>	<p>Activities</p>	<p>Responsible Entity</p>	<p>Timeline</p>
<p>Work more closely with recycling enterprises, as part of inclusive IWM governance that makes space for private sector participation in several ways.</p>	<p>The NSP is promoting the integration of the private sector using the Private-Public-Partnership (PPP) model, which mainly involves waste treatment enterprises. The NSP is already connected to recycling enterprises and will follow-up with their participation in the PPP model.</p>	<p>NSP</p>	<p>2022</p>
<p>Recommendation 19</p>	<p>Activities</p>	<p>Responsible Entity</p>	<p>Timeline</p>
<p>Ask for an extension of the NSP for two years.*</p>	<p>The proposal for an NSP extension is under preparation. The drafted proposal will be submitted to the TSU in the second half of the year 2021.</p>	<p>NSP</p>	<p>Second half of 2021</p>
<p>Recommendation 20</p>	<p>Activities</p>	<p>Responsible Entity</p>	<p>Timeline</p>
<p>Strengthen the institutional position of CAUES as the long-term institutional home for capacity building, training, and IWM strategy preparation.</p>	<p>The NSP signed an implementation agreement with CAUES to ensure long-term project activities even beyond the NSP implementation period.</p>	<p>NSP</p>	<p>August 2020</p>

* Note: the NSP considers that this recommendation is difficult to be fulfilled and covered under the current NSP framework without a project extension.

Recommendation 21	Activities	Who	When
Link with 11 next stage cities in time for the TA2 to do a series of training on how to make an IWM Strategy and focus on Zero Waste/Zero Harm including CO2 and other GHG aspects. *	The Train-the-Trainer program of the NSP will qualify 20 waste management experts and operators to further disseminate the IWM strategy with the focus of the MSW harmless treatment and low-carbon development of China's waste sector.	NSP	July 2021
Recommendation 22	Activities	Responsible Entity	Timeline
Talk to the 15 Chinese Zero Waste cities and link them to the project. *	The NSP is already connected to the Zero Waste Cities to find synergies to the NSP. The Solid Waste and Chemicals Management Center of MEE is responsible for the initiative in China. The NSP invited them to share their activities during the International Conference on Waste Management and Technology 2021, which is sub-organised by the NSP.	NSP	June 2021
Recommendation 23	Activities	Responsible Entity	Timeline
Expand the role of CAUES on producing standards for IWM.	During the work plan preparation for 2021, the NSP agreed with CAUES to strengthen the implementation of technical standards and policy recommendations in the current year.	NSP	Since January 2021
Recommendation 24	Activities	Responsible Entity	Timeline
Work with CAUES to create an IWM Planning Guide tailored and adapted to Chinese circumstances – with some sections newly written and some translated from English and/or German.*	An IWM guideline is planned by the NSP to be delivered by the Sino-International Technical Consortium based on the overall improvements in the five pilot cities. However, the work schedule has been delayed due to COVID-19 related travel restrictions. Furthermore, together with CAUES, a publication on IWM Guide should be drafted by the end of the project.	NSP	Since January 2020
Recommendation 25	Activities	Responsible Entity	Timeline
Develop a line of shorter publications or internet-based training modules focusing not on substance, but methods: e.g. full-cost analysis, lifecycle assessment (LCA), activity-based costing, PAYT, waste	This part will be further adapted in the online courses provided by Adelphi (Train-the-Trainer), and also for the online training programmes in the following implementation period.	NSP	Since April 2020

* Note: the NSP considers that this recommendation is difficult to be fulfilled and covered under the current NSP framework without a project extension.

characterisation and composition, UNFCCC-compliant MRV guidelines for the waste sector.			
---	--	--	--

Overarching Recommendation for a 2- year extension:

Recommendation	Activities	Who	When
Necessity for a two-year budget-neutral extension for the NSP.	In line with the NAMA Facility's amendment policy, an NSP can submit a request for extension of the implementation period to the TSU. Donors have the possibility to approve (with or without conditions) or reject the request.	TSU, Board	Depending on when an extension request will be submitted by the NSP

** Note: the NSP considers that this recommendation is difficult to be fulfilled and covered under the current NSP framework without a project extension.*